



Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS

on the Bachelor, Master and Doctoral degree programmes

“Management” (Bachelor of Economics)

“Management” (Master of Management)

“Management” (Doctor of Management)

“Office Management Education” (Bachelor of Education)

offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Based on the report of the expert panel and the extensive discussions of the Standing Commission on 29 May 2020, the Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “**Management**” (**Bachelor of Economics**), “**Management**” (**Master of Management**) and “**Management**” (**Doctor of Management**) offered by **Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditation is unconditional.

The study programmes comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version.

2. The study programme “**Office Management Education**” (**Bachelor of Education**) offered by **Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia** is accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditation is conditional.

The study programme essentially complies with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of nine months.

3. The condition has to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the condition has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **28 February 2021**.
4. The accreditation for all programmes is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2026**.

Condition for “Office Management Education”:

1. The university has to make sure that the programme corresponds to level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework and transparently describe the relevant skills to be acquired to become a teacher.

The following **recommendations** are given for the further improvement of the programmes:

All programmes:

1. Current issues, such as Industry 4.0 and digitalization, should be included in the curricula of the Bachelor and Master programmes more prominently, and current trends in the field should be integrated into the curricula as quickly as possible.
2. The university should further develop its aim of internationalization. In order to strengthen internationalization at home, the university could increase the number of courses taught in English and invite guest lecturers from foreign universities.
3. Efforts to conduct joint research with staff from other universities in Indonesia and beyond should be fostered.
4. The intended learning outcomes of courses in the programmes should be focused and reduced to a number of essential outcomes, of which the achievement can be monitored.
5. The assessment forms in the programmes should be aligned with the essential learning outcomes, including less written exams and a larger variety of assessment types.
6. Students of all programmes should receive greater access to current and up-to-date literature, especially literature in English. This also includes access to a larger number of international journals.
7. The experts recommend to use the data from QA as a strategic tool more intensely.
8. UPI should increase its efforts to employ teaching staff which has been qualified outside Bandung and Indonesia.

“Management” (Bachelor of Economics):

9. Academic writing should be trained more intensely, e.g. by offering a mandatory course within the curriculum.
10. Assessment criteria including the composition of the grade could be outlined more transparently for students prior to the beginning of the lecture period, e.g. in the course catalogue.

“Management” (Master of Management):

11. The programme could highlight the relevance of its specializations in order to sharpen the profile of the programme but also to indicate the individual profiles of its graduates.
12. The faculty should closely monitor the performance of students with and without a first degree in Management in case performances differ and students without a first degree in Management need further assistance.

“Management” (Doctor of Management):

13. Currently, UPI offers two structures in the doctoral programme, a “doctor by course” and a “doctor by research”. The experts recommend to revise the programme into one structured programme with limited initial course work and subsequent research and publications.
14. It is recommended to increase the credit hours of teaching staff for research in the programme.

“Office Management Education” (Bachelor of Education):

15. The programme should focus exclusively on teacher education and all courses should contribute to the acquisition of relevant skills to become a teacher.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.



Experts' Report

on the Bachelor, Master and Doctoral degree programmes

“Management” (Bachelor of Economics)

“Management” (Master of Management)

“Management” (Doctor of Management)

“Office Management Education” (Bachelor of Education)

offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Visit to the university: 2–6 March 2020

Panel of Experts:

Prof. Dr. Ilona Ebbers	Europa Universität Flensburg, International Institute of Management and Economic Education, Department of Economics and its Didactics
Prof. Dr. Ellen Roemer	University of Applied Sciences Ruhr West, Institute of Business Administration
Prof. Brian C. Gozun	De La Salle University – Manila, Ramon V. del Rosario College of Business, Decision Sciences and Innovation Department
Dr. Hans-Dieter Schinner	International Industrial Consult AG, Frankfurt (Labour market representative)
Thorben Steenmanns	Student at Rhein-Waal University of Applied Sciences (Student representative)

Coordinator:

Doris Herrmann,
Dr. Dorothee Groeger

AQAS, Cologne, Germany

Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution

I. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor, Master and Doctoral degree programmes in “Management” and the Bachelor programme in “Office Management Education” offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.

1. Criteria

The programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to a programme.

2. Approach and methodology

The initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in May 2019.

The university produced a self-evaluation report (SER). In September 2019, the UPI handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the programmes and an appendix.

The appendix included e.g.:

- Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student drop outs).
- CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors
- Information on student services
- Core information on the main library
- academic regulations

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in December 2019.

The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 25 November 2019.

The nomination of the panel of expert

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles for the selection of experts of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Standing Commission nominated in December 2019 the before mentioned expert panel. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

The preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the University and to the panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

The site visit

After a review of the self-evaluation report, a site visit to the University took place from 2 – 6 March 2020. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the HEI, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussions and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

The report writing

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for the programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Accreditation Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

The decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, on 29 May 2020 the Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In July 2020, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

II. General Information on the University

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI) is a multi-campus university located mainly in Bandung, West Java. The higher education institution was founded in 1954 as a teacher education college and has since been further expanded and developed into its current status as a state university. UPI offers a wide range of Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes for both teacher education and other employment fields along 6 campuses. On its main campus, UPI runs 8 faculties and

1 postgraduate school. In total, the university offers 171 programmes for appr. 37,500 students (December 2019).

According to UPI, the university strives to implement a “Tri Dharma” of higher education, that is education, research and community service interrelated. Research conducted by programmes aims to solve problems that occur in society by using and developing scientific methods. Research can then be used to enrich teaching material so that students gain more applicative insights related to the sciences learned in class. Students are said to be involved in lecturer research activities.

In particular, UPI formulates the following aims: 1) producing educators, educational staff, scientists and experts in all types and programmes of higher education, who have global competitive and comparative advantages; and 2) producing, developing, and disseminating knowledge and technology to improve the welfare of the community.

The Bachelor programmes to be accredited are affiliated with the Faculty of Economics and Business Education located in Bandung. Appr. 3,000 students are currently enrolled in 7 programmes. Personnel constitutes 110 lecturers and an education staff of 33. The faculty is led by a dean and 3 vice-deans.

The Master and Doctoral programmes are run by the School of Postgraduate Studies, which has a total of 34 Master and 21 Doctoral programmes. Master students amount to appr. 2,600; doctoral students constitute appr. 880.

A chairperson / head of study programme is allocated for each programme.

III. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the Curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.</i></p> <p><i>The curriculum’s design is readily available and transparently formulated.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.2]</p>	<p><i>The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>The academic level of graduates corresponds with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.</i></p> <p><i>The curriculum’s design is readily available and transparently formulated.</i></p>

Description

UPI uses a local credit system based on the tertiary education system in Indonesia. 1 credit (called Semester Credit Unit SKS) is equivalent to 36 hours per semester, that is 12 meetings which include scheduled lecture activities, structured assignments and independent assignments.

“Management” (Bachelor & Master degree) & “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

The **Bachelor programme in “Management”** is designed to educate students to become line managers, researchers and entrepreneurs, according to UPI. Graduates shall acquire an integrity of the sciences and the profession they will work in as well as knowledge and skills in line with the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework. Possible fields of employment for graduates are defined by UPI as companies, government agencies or educational institutions.

The university outlines human resource management, marketing management, financial management and operations management as main foci of the programme. The programme covers 8 semesters with a total of 146 SKS credits.

The curriculum is grouped into several areas of courses: general courses (14 SKS credits), university specific courses (2 SKS credits), faculty skills courses (6 SKS credits), core study programme skills courses (102 SKS credits), study skills courses (18 SKS credits) and field experience practice courses (4 SKS credits).

UPI characterizes the curriculum with regard to a learning pyramid. In the first and second semester, basic courses are provided such as Religious Education, Sports, Indonesian Language Education and English Language. Starting in the third semester, core study programme courses train skills in subjects such as human resource management, marketing management, financial management and operations management. In the sixth semester, courses cover real work lectures that teach students to practice courses actively involved in community empowerment. The seventh semester is designed for an internship at a company to gain learning experience. The thesis in the final semester provides 6 SKS credits.

The core study programme skills courses are compulsory, among them the 4 foci with 12 SKS credits each. Offerings within the study skills courses are elective and provide a choice of 2 out of 5.

Several elements in the programme are supposed to facilitate the employability of students, such as public lectures of practitioners, the internship as well as visits to businesses.

With the **Master programme in “Management”**, which was established in 2005, UPI aims at educating graduates who master broad concepts and insights in management and exercise professionalism with entrepreneurial character and competent management science research expertise. Thematically, the research focuses on the areas of strategic management, finance, marketing, human resources and entrepreneurship. This corresponds to the study concentrations in the curriculum: human resource management, financial management, marketing management, strategic and operations management, and (recently introduced) entrepreneurship and IT management.

The curriculum is described by UPI as research-based to foster new business practices and management knowledge for a sustainable development. According to the university, it involves students in various research activities and field surveys for research topics. Students shall gain experiences in practicing various research methods, including the development and validation of research instruments, data collection and reporting, analysis and writing.

Additionally, the programme facilitates community services of students and graduates through network expansion, collaboration with educational institutions, companies, governments, professional organizations and relevant national and international institutions, according to the information in the self-evaluation report (SER). Graduates are said to be working as management and business

consultants, CEOs, educators in higher education and leaders of enterprises, both state-owned and private.

The programme can be studied by students with a linear educational background as well as with a non-linear background, i.e. without a prior Management or Business education. The curriculum for non-linear students covers more credits in order to compensate for missing content. As outlined in the SER, the curriculum design includes 3 postgraduate expertise courses (Philosophy of Science, Applied Statistics, Pedagogic Studies), 5 study programme core expertise courses (Research Methodology, Intermediate HR Management, Intermediate Marketing Management, Middle Financial Management and Middle Strategic Management) and 4 elective courses. Courses compulsory for students with a non-linear academic background are called aanvullen courses.

The goals to be achieved by the **Bachelor programme in “Office Management Education”** are defined by UPI as educating competent educators in the field of office management, carrying out scientific research to develop knowledge in the field of office management and to provide community service in a professional manner as an effort to apply innovation in office management. The programme is designed to prepare prospective teachers of vocational schools in the field of office management, in particular in the fields of quality management system, filing management, digital office communication and digital office. According to UPI, graduates are supposed to be able to educate, teach, guide, direct, train, evaluate and develop innovative creative learning by utilizing various innovative relevant learning resources and technology. Additionally, the programme also prepares for professional work as archivist, quality auditor and public relations and digital office expert staff, as outlined in the SER.

The curriculum is described by UPI to address both hard skill and soft skill competencies (attitude, knowledge and skills) which are applied subject-specifically as well as with regard to cross-subject aspects. Curricular elements are general courses, educational courses, learning subjects, educational unit field experience courses, faculty subjects and study programme courses. Of the overall 57 courses, 51 are compulsory.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

UPI defines to educate doctors of management who are able to develop new knowledge in management, solve complex management problems, promote scientific and technological progress, develop research for management science development and disseminate the benefits of research and knowledge development as objectives of the **Doctoral programme in Management**. The research conducted as part of the programme focuses on strategic management research and studies, finance, marketing, human resources as well as entrepreneurship, according to the information in the SER. The Doctoral programme shall contribute to UPI’s vision of expanding international recognition by conducting strategic partnerships with international institutions.

According to the university, students are involved in teaching research activities through joint research programmes or doctoral grants and they can participate in research projects which may lead to the final project topic that can be selected as part of the completion of studies in the form of a dissertation. The programme is designed for students with a linear educational background who acquire 37 SKS and for students with a non-linear background who have to take 56 SKS credits.

The programme is offered in two structures: “doctor by course” and “doctor by research”. The first option requires a higher percentage of course participation and attendance. The courses offered consist of postgraduate expertise courses (“Science Philosophy”, “Pedagogical Studies”, “Advanced Applied Statistics”), core study programme expertise courses (“Advanced Human Resource Management”, “Advanced Marketing Management”, “Advanced Financial Management”, “Advanced Strategic Management”, “Advanced Research Methodology”), elective courses from a wide variety of topics (e.g. “Enterprise Architecture”, “Strategic Leadership” or “Information System

Management Research Design Study”) and – for students with a non-linear educational background – aanvullen courses. The dissertation covers 15 SKS credits.

The “doctor by research” option is a programme whose main educational process is through research. Nevertheless, students must pass a limited number of courses, such as “Advanced Research Methodology”, “Foundation of Pedagogy” and two courses related to the topic of the students’ research (as recommended by the supervisor). Other courses can be taken by students as needed with the permission of the supervisor. All courses must be completed by students in the probationary phase in the first semester or no later than the second semester to then proceed to the dissertation completion stage.

Further curricula elements are described by UPI: As part of a “studium generale” experts both from an academic and practical background are invited to encourage students to improve communication skills, analytical skills and synthesis and thereby develop relationships with experts both from within and outside the country. The “Sandwich Programme” is a research internship programme at domestic and foreign institutions. The apprenticeship programme can be used by students to accelerate the completion of their studies. Finally, a guest lecture programme is coordinated to integrate foreign lecturers who are experts in the field of management into the programme.

Experts’ Evaluation

General

Overall, the experts appreciate the “Tri Dharma”-approach of the university, especially that students are forced to go out into the community – with a special focus on rural areas within Indonesia. This may support the personal development of students and contribute to the societal development in the individual regions. Anchoring the university in all areas of society helps UPI to achieve a high level of popularity and recognition in the region and beyond.

Furthermore, the pedagogical approach of UPI which is implemented in pedagogical courses in each non-educational programme is favourable and it constitutes a strength of the university, like a unique-selling point. Basic knowledge on how to transfer information adequately can be helpful for a professional career and in developing a leadership personality.

The experts have learned that graduates are well prepared for the labour market and that they find employment relatively quickly. The university enjoys a high reputation among employers due to the good education in the Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes. The average duration until employment after graduation is 3–6 months; employment is often found with banks or larger companies in industry and government.

UPI cooperates, for example, with national banks, companies as well as international companies. UPI’s approach of including entrepreneurship aspects in all its programmes is welcomed by the experts and a relatively large number of students (approximately 5% of graduates) become entrepreneurs or aim to do so. They found start-ups in e.g. fashion, culinary or electronics, as staff and students reported.

The Master graduates are prepared for positions in middle management and the doctoral students are qualified for top management positions. The graduates find employment quite often either through the excellently functioning alumni network, through their internships or via employers who have already employed UPI graduates and are highly satisfied with the quality of their education. All in all, the employability of the graduates of the Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes are fully meeting the expectations of the labour market.

However, the contents of the modules and the curricula should be revised more often with regard to the current requirements of the labour market. Current issues, such as Industry 4.0 and digitalization, should be included in the curricula more prominently. Trends in the field should be monitored

closely and should be integrated into the curricula as quickly as possible (**Finding 1**, see also Chapter IV.2).

For the enhancement of the programmes, the university should further develop its aim of internationalization (**Finding 2**). UPI offers attractive study abroad options. However, the number of students participating in these programmes is limited. In order to strengthen “internationalization at home”, the university could increase the number of courses taught in English and invite guest lecturers from foreign universities. A “window” for student mobility could be introduced to support the internationalization strategy of the university and foster student exchange. Vice versa, more visiting professors should be invited to give lectures on the latest trends in the field. Students should be encouraged to use more English sources for their Bachelor thesis. Finally, the number of double degrees could be increased and efforts for staff to conduct joint research with colleagues from other universities in Indonesia and beyond should be fostered (**Finding 3**).

All elements of the curricula are assigned a certain number of credits directly related to the expected workload. The total workload of each programme is allocated to the different courses and is clearly documented and presented in various modalities.

“Management” (Bachelor degree)

The objectives of the study programme relate to the corresponding level of the National Qualifications Framework and they cover the appropriate aspects for preparing students to become professionals in the field of Management. The curriculum supports the achievement of the learning objectives and it is composed of general character-building courses and Management related topics in a balanced manner. However, academic writing should be trained more intensely in the programme, e.g. by offering a mandatory course within the curriculum (**Finding 4**).

The experts have been informed about the obligation of the university by national regulations to define very detailed learning outcomes. Hence, the experts read as many as 20 learning objectives for one course. Such a large number of objectives is usually of little help. The learning outcomes of courses should be focused and reduced to a number of essential outcomes, presented e. g. in the syllabi of courses (**Finding 5**, see also Chapter IV.6). This is supposed to help not only the students to gain a better orientation of their learning success, but also the instructors to improve the monitoring and assessment of the learning outcomes. Furthermore, the assessment criteria should be aligned with those essential learning outcomes, including less examinations and a larger variety of assessment forms (**Finding 6**, see Chapter IV.3). Generally, the experts recommend to UPI to use the intended learning outcomes as a strategic tool.

With regard to the assessment of the modules, a clear structure regarding which type of assessment students have to undergo as well as the shares how much the modules contribute to the final grade should be included in the module handbook (**Finding 7**). The syllabus of the module should be used as a tool for communication between teachers and students regarding the assessment and the shares that each form of assessment takes. In addition, the literature in the module handbook should be updated and access should be given to the students via the library (**Finding 8**, see Chapter IV.6). A grading scheme might be helpful for the joint supervisors of the Bachelor thesis to standardize the assessment procedure pointing out the criteria for assessing the thesis as well as their shares. In this way, students get a higher transparency on the criteria against which they are assessed and the supervisors can align their assessment.

The experts welcome the intended change of degree to “Bachelor of Management” as they have been informed during the site visit and they encourage the university to implement the change as soon as possible.

The studies can be accelerated by taking modules during the summer break (see also Chapter IV.4). Therefore, the diversity of students is accounted for in a way that good students are able to finish their studies earlier. All curricular elements are well documented in the module handbook.

“Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

In general, the programme is very relevant for Indonesia because teachers in Office Management Education are needed as the experts learned from UPI management as well as labor market representatives. All curricular elements and their functions are well documented. Also, the curriculum defines which elements are compulsory and which are electives. Furthermore, an idealized typical course plan is available.

Intended learning outcomes are described very much in detail. This is a weakness in the programme as well as in the other Bachelor programmes which was examined in the accreditation (see above). With a large number of learning outcomes, it is difficult to prove if all these outcomes will be achieved. Even though the labor market experts were satisfied with the competences of the graduates, the recommendation by the experts is to slim down these detailed learning outcomes in a transparent and focused way (**Finding 5**, see also above and Chapter IV.6).

The course contents seem to be slightly behind the current requirements of the industry. Especially digital requirements of current office management could be addressed more prominently. The contents of the courses should be developed in the direction of work 5.0 (**Finding 1**, see above).

A very crucial point for the achievement of the learning objectives is the content of the core programme courses. The question arose in the discussion with teaching staff if every module in the core skills area meets the standards of level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework. For example, there are modules like “Office Management”, “Typing” or “Document Processing Applications” which in their description seem to be very basic and which focus less on the didactics of these professions but rather on the simple achievement of office skills. Their contents rather resemble that of courses taught in vocational schools in Europe. Thus, the university has to demonstrate that the programme is delivered on level 6 and transparently describe the skills to be acquired relevant to become a teacher (**Finding 9**).

The profile of the academic degree is focused on three parts: These parts are (1) becoming a teacher, (2) becoming a practitioner, or (3) becoming a researcher. As the experts learned, approximately 68% of the students want to become a teacher, 14% a practitioner and 18% an entrepreneur. However, because the programme is an education programme, the graduates should be predominantly supported in becoming a teacher. This means that the programme should deliver more pedagogical and didactical elements (**Finding 10**). Given that this kind of changes are implemented in the programme, then the other two profiles should be neglected or entirely dismissed because the needs of the students in this stream are different from the teachers’ qualification profile.

Furthermore, the internship is valued with considerably less credit points compared to European standards; the duration is usually 1–2 months and students receive 4 SKS credits. It should be checked if the amount of credits can be raised – respecting national regulations.

Also, the level of classes taught in English could be developed. In the discussion with the teaching staff, it became obvious that only a few classes are held in English. Even the exams should be held in English (see above).

“Management” (Master degree)

The desired qualifications to be achieved during the programme are presented as intended learning outcomes and are governed by the national qualifications framework. Given the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework, the graduates of this programme have both multi-disciplinary and

inter-disciplinary perspectives in the field of Management Science and the programme is a continuous progression of the expansion of the learning outcomes from the Bachelor programme.

The intended learning outcomes are appropriate for the Master programme which is also evidenced by the satisfaction of graduates and the employers. The faculty and university have appropriate feedback mechanisms to trace their graduates and assess the sentiments and the satisfaction of the employers (see Chapter IV.2).

The programme is traditionally structured allowing for a specialization within the field of Management. The experts welcome that the intended learning outcomes are updated according to current developments in the academic/scientific field and labor market. The recent introduction of new specializations, entrepreneurship and IT management is favorable. The presence of highly specialized courses and electives provide students the opportunity to learn in-depth which is useful for the labor market. The experts recommend that the programme highlights the relevance of its specializations in order to sharpen the profile but also to indicate the individual profiles of graduates. This would increase marketing measures and it would help students in their application process (**Finding 11**). It would be beneficial if the faculty and university benchmarked the programme with the best in the Southeast Asian Region and the rest of the world.

Students in this programme are well-versed in research methodologies as the focus on research is well set. Upon completion of the programme, the achievement of the intended level of qualification is demonstrated by a final thesis.

The academic degree awarded to the graduates corresponds to the learning outcomes and the requirements of the minimum level of the European Qualifications Framework as well as to the respective level of the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework. The programme has tracks for those who have completed a Bachelor degree in "Management" and for those coming from other fields. This can be advantageous for both parties but it also means longer study periods for those coming from a non-Management background. The faculty could look on how to further improve the programme for those from non-Management backgrounds by closely monitoring the different study groups (**Finding 12**, see Chapter IV.4).

The curricular structure supports the achievement of the learning outcomes adequately as evidences in the various modalities offered, both for graduates of Management degrees and those from a non-linear background. Bridging courses are also offered to students who need it. The order of curricular elements supports the learner's progression: postgraduate expertise course, expertise courses core study, study programme elective courses and bridging courses.

The curriculum covers subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge as well as subject-related (core study skills courses and elective skills courses), methodological (postgraduate expertise courses) and general skills (core study skills courses and elective skills courses) in a balanced manner. Courses are documented on the level of their intended learning outcomes through the online learning system and course contracts. However, the curriculum would benefit from increasing topics related to science and technology.

The curriculum defines which elements are compulsory and which are electives as shown in the listing of study skills courses and elective skills courses. All of the curricular elements and their functions are documented both online and offline. The programme has extensive information on its website and students can readily access this information. There is an idealized typical course plan that is available online and offline by which students from various tracks can design their programme of study.

It is transparently described which elements are offered exclusively for the programme and which parts are used in other programmes as evidenced by the connection and progressions of courses from postgraduate expertise courses to core study skills courses and then to elective skills courses.

The curricular modifications are documented and are used in the continuous improvement of the curriculum. However, a more formal mechanism of documentation would further benefit the programme.

The programme includes specific elements for part-time studies and international students which provides flexibility to working students and foreigners.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

The desired qualifications to be achieved during the programme are well presented as intended learning outcomes and are both subject-specific and interdisciplinary in nature. The Doctoral programme envisions doctoral graduates who are professional, entrepreneurial and competent through collaboration with educational institutions, companies, governments, professional organizations and other relevant national and international institutions.

The intended learning outcomes have shown to be appropriate and adequate. The graduates of the faculty and university are highly sought after by the labor market, in this case, most academic institutions hire the doctoral graduates of this school. Moreover, the university and faculty have constantly collected feedback from various stakeholders to improve the programme.

The intended learning outcomes are constantly updated according to current developments in the academic field and the labor market. A corresponding process is followed by the faculty and university. However, a more thorough documentation of this process can be undertaken by the university.

The academic degree awarded to the graduates corresponds with the learning outcomes and the requirements of the respective level of the European Qualifications Framework and corresponds with the respective level of the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework.

Upon completion of the programme, the achievement of the intended level of qualifications can be demonstrated by a dissertation, research publications and conference presentations, among others. The programme may be studied “by course” or “by research”, providing students with two different pathways of achieving the Doctoral degree, which caters to students’ different needs. However, the experts believe that a combination of research and course work would benefit all students best and rather comply with international standards in doctoral education. Thus, the experts recommend to revise the programme into one structured programme with limited initial course work and subsequent research and publications (**Finding 13**).

A time plan is set up into which key milestones of doctoral research are embedded. This plan is used for orientation and guidance throughout the duration of studies among the doctoral students. Moreover, the smooth interpersonal relationship between faculty and student makes learning much more manageable.

The structure of the programme supports the achievement of the learning outcomes. The order of curricular elements supports the learner’s progression and the programme has provisions for various types of learners. Students with a Master degree in Management take the least number of courses compared to students whose Master degree is from a non-Management field.

The “by course”-programme clearly defines which elements are compulsory and which are elective, and the programme is divided into postgraduate expertise courses, core study skills courses, elective skills courses, and bridging courses (aanvullen courses).

The programme covers the acquisition of subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge (core study skills and elective skills courses) as well as of subject-related (core study skills courses and elective skills courses), methodological (postgraduate expertise courses) and general skills (core study skills courses and elective skills courses). This is documented on the level of the intended learning outcomes.

All programme elements and their functions are documented both online and offline. The students have ready access to pertinent information on their programme whenever needed. It is transparently described which courses are offered exclusively for the programme and which parts are used in other programmes such as those in the Master programme (aanvullen courses) and other Doctoral programmes of the university.

Conclusion

For the Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes in “Management”, the criterion is fulfilled. The desired qualifications to be achieved during the programmes are presented as intended learning outcomes and are both subject-specific and interdisciplinary in nature. The curricula support the learning outcomes in an adequate manner and students are well prepared for employment. For further improvement, the experts recommend to reduce the number of learning outcomes to only a few whose achievement can be easily traced. The programmes would also benefit from further internationalization efforts, especially a higher number of courses taught in English.

For the Bachelor programme “Office Management Education”, the criterion is partly fulfilled. The learning outcomes are transparently described. However, the curricular elements which shall support the learning outcomes are not comprehensively described along the relevant level of the qualifications framework. Furthermore, the experts recommend to focus the learning outcomes on teacher education and to streamline the curriculum on only this qualification aim.

2. Procedures for Quality Assurance

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The programme is subject to the higher education institution’s policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.</i></p> <p><i>A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]</i></p>	<p><i>The programme is subject to the higher education institution’s policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.</i></p> <p><i>A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.</i></p> <p><i>Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]</i></p>

Description

Generally, the quality assurance policies at UPI rest on national and internal regulations, as stated in the self-evaluation report. UPI has implemented a Strategic Plan 2016–2020 in which policies, key performance indicators, annual targets, responsible parties and implementing units are defined.

With the Strategic Plan UPI wants to become a “pioneering and superior university in the ASEAN region”. Indicators for the achievement of this goal are, for example, the number of programmes with international accreditation and the number of students who graduate in time.

Responsible parties and implementing units are defined on various levels, as outlined in the SER: a Quality Assurance Unit on university level, a Quality Control Unit on faculty level or postgraduate school level, respectively, and a Quality Control Cluster on programme level. These units operate differently regarding a programme: the Quality Assurance Unit and the Quality Control Unit develop quality standards, provide assistance and evaluate the implementation of quality assurance on university/faculty level. The Quality Control Cluster implements and ensures that quality assurance works well within the programme.

Internally, UPI applies a so-called Internal Quality Audit instrument to assess the quality of programmes annually. Additionally, each programme files a semi-annual and final report to measure its performance in the current year. External assessment is supposed to be based on the ISO 9001 certification body.

Furthermore, UPI conducts several surveys, according to the SER. Among those are student satisfaction and lecturer performance questionnaires at the end of the semester and regular tracer studies of graduates/alumni. UPI claims to use the collected data in further developing the programmes.

UPI outlines that it collects information from stakeholders internally as well as externally. Information is collected through methods including questionnaires and in-depth interviews.

Experts' Evaluation

UPI and its faculties pursue a consistent and effective quality assurance strategy. The university has an integrated task force, the Quality Assurance Unit, that is supported by the faculty's Quality Control Unit.

The quality assurance system is very elaborate. It contains sufficient tools and mechanisms of collecting feedback and student data (e. g. tracer studies, student questionnaires, regular meetings). The faculty along with its quality assurance procedures is certified to the ISO 9001: 2015 standard.

UPI follows a clear and elaborate quality-oriented structure. In addition, the feedback culture from students to staff members is very open so that improvements can take place. A semi-annual and an annual report is provided by each study programme. The experts perceived a good feedback culture in the programmes.

In every semester, students are filling out an online questionnaire at the end of the term. The questionnaire is anonymously conducted by the Quality Assurance Unit. Students cannot receive their grades before the questionnaire has been completed. In this way, representative samples can be drawn. In addition, graduates are able to provide their feedback in a tracer study. Afterwards, the results of the study are discussed with professional associations.

Major curricular revisions are scheduled every 5 years; minor changes on course level are implemented regularly. The experts recommend to shorten the time-span for the major curricula revisions, especially against the background of fast-changing trends in the profession of Management (Finding 1, see Chapter IV.1).

Student data is collected and managed in UPI's management information system, in which academic activities, research, service, and other supporting activities are integrated. The information is made available to the stakeholders through the university's website.

There is no doubt that the university reacts to the feedback collected and results provided by the quality assurance units. But it stays unclear to the experts how the results are used for the strategic

development of the university. It would be recommendable to summarize qualitative and quantitative data from the QA procedures in the different faculties and provide them to the management of the university as a kind of “management summary”. This would enable the management to use quality assurance as a strategic tool more intensely (**Finding 14**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled. UPI applies adequate and manifold quality assurance tools which have led to an impressive feedback culture in which stakeholders’ feedback is valued and appreciated. To use the data in a more strategic way, the experts recommend to focus on the follow-up of QA results more prominently.

3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students / Learning and Assessment of Students

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.</i></p> <p><i>Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.</i></p> <p><i>Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.3]</p>	<p><i>The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.</i></p> <p><i>Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.3]</p>

Description

“Management” (Bachelor & Master degree) & “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

The academic calendar is said to be determined before the beginning of the semester by the university’s Academic Directorate. Scheduling is carried out with the help of a software programme.

In the Bachelor programmes, UPI applies 4 types of teaching/learning styles: lectures in- and outside the classroom, laboratory work, field experience programmes (internships) and community service programmes or real work lectures, respectively. Learning is supposed to be carried out by encouraging students to think critically and explore, create and experiment by utilizing various sources.

In the Master programme, the curriculum is delivered via lectures, discussions and contextual learning methods, as stated in the SER. More than 50 % of learning time is supposed to be used for discussions and presentations. Students are given tasks that must be solved by looking for learning resources independently and the results are presented in a discussion which is claimed by UPI to support student-oriented learning.

For students who work part time, UPI claims to offer a compensation system with a lower attendance rate. Facilities are specially equipped for students with special needs, according to the university.

According to UPI, the learning process is measured via quizzes, individual and group assignments, midterm and final exams. Exams may be computer-based or use multiple choice or essays. In the Master programme, exams rather take the form of essays or analysis/mini-research.

A study programme curriculum team works closely together with the faculty in drafting exam schedules, as laid out in the SER. The exam schedule is listed in the Academic Calendar.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

The teaching and learning approach within the programme is supposed to be realized by critical analysis, inquiry-based learning, project-based learning, mini research, collaborative learning, cooperative learning, presentations, discussions, seminars, report writing or actual, independent learning and field studies. As outlined by UPI, learning and teaching are interactive, and more than 50% of learning time is to be used for discussion and presentations.

Learning evaluation activities are listed as mid semester examinations and final tests. The forms of the exam questions provided are adjusted to the learning objectives for each subject. In general, assignments are given in the form of essays to improve analytical skills. Another form is through analysis and mini research related to certain areas of concentration.

Experts’ Evaluation

Overall, the programmes follow adequate teaching and learning strategies and the outcomes are properly assessed in various modalities. The programmes provide clear documentation in relation to teaching and learning. The use of e-learning within the programmes is impressive. UPI uses a good software programme to provide material and keep student records.

However, the programmes could be further improved by including more strategies attuned to the needs of 21st century learners. The faculty and university can look at veering away from more traditional assessment schemes to more outcomes-based approaches such as presentations in conference or creation of products or services (**Finding 6**, see also Chapter IV. 1). Also, an increase in internationalization activities could further enhance the outcomes of the programmes and create learners who do not only serve the region and the country, but to become global citizens as well (**Finding 2**, see also Chapter IV.1).

Grading scales and the distribution of grades are documented, assessed and clearly defined. The level of ability and grade categories are presented in accordance with the education implementation guidelines of the university.

A formal procedure for student appeals is in place where students can submit complaints or suggestions through various mechanisms on programme, faculty and university level.

“Management” (Bachelor & Master degree) & “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

The methods of teaching and learning are appropriate and correspond with the intended learning outcomes of the Bachelor programmes in “Management” and “Office Management Education” as well as the Master programme in “Management”. The programmes provide a variety of learning activities within and outside the classroom. The inclusion of field experience activities, for example, provides for a richer experience for students to learn outside the classroom. Also, the community service programme paves the way for graduates who are not only business-minded but also socially and morally responsible business leaders. For the “Office Management Education” programme, the inclusion of “Real Work Lecture” activities challenge the students to improve their preparation, delivery and assessment of lectures within a classroom setting.

The methods of teaching and learning respect and consider the diversity of students and their needs, enabling flexible learning paths which are evident in activities that are done within and outside the university. Active learning is encouraged since it enables the learners to be the leaders in their study programme. Case studies, roleplaying, team discussions, among others, are ways to

increase participation of students to learn from their instructors and from their classmates. For the Master programme, the lecturers are given flexibility to use suitable learning strategies to meet learning objectives.

Didactic methods stimulate student motivation, self-reflection and engagement in the learning process which is evident in the presence of activities that makes students analyze, observe and solve problems, express opinion and discuss ideas. The open nature of learning is commendable, and the students learn not only from the materials but from their peers as well. Competitions such as those done during the Student Creativity Week provide avenues for students to be creative and experiment. For the Master programme, 50% of the learning time is allotted for discussions and presentations which provides students with the opportunity to expand their knowledge and learn independently. The use of a learning information system accommodates the needs of working students, international students and students with other needs.

The assessment regulations and procedures are defined and made readily available in published form to students. The presence of a college contact through an online system is a commendable way of providing for a transparent system of guidance between student and supervisor. The schedule of activities for various assessment strategies is connected to the university intranet which is accessible to learners. For the Master programme, the students are provided with subjects that are grouped into various fields of concentration.

The assessment methods for each course are appropriate for the learning outcomes as defined in the course description. The principle of evaluation follows the Ministry of Education's decrees which makes the strategies authentic, objective and transparent. The assessment strategies are clearly indicated which include the following major activities: quizzes, group and/or individual tasks, discussion group activities, mid-term test, and final examination. For the Master programme, the study load is clearly indicated for the students and it also aims to maximize the university facilities and availability of faculty members.

The programmes' design ensures that every student is familiarized with an appropriate spectrum of examination types over the course of the studies. If there is a choice among different methods for individual examinations, a mechanism is in place to ensure that students must absolve the desired spectrum of exam choices over the course of the programme which is evident in the listing of learning activities in the syllabus. Student learning is continuously assessed in various stages of the programmes by a variety of challenging strategies and techniques that encourage students to think critically and creatively. As outlined earlier, the focus should be put on introducing further, modern assessment forms to reduce the number of written examinations.

The QA processes for assessment consider that assessors are familiar with examination methods and receive support in developing their own skills in this field which is evident in the Applied Approach training programme provided to lecturers. Lecturers are trained to develop, design, compile and evaluate learning materials to continuously improve the quality of the overall teaching and learning process (see Chapter IV.5).

The changes to the examination concept are documented and explained through a study programme curriculum team which works closely to match schedules of both the university and the faculty. The schedules for the examinations are clearly spelled out and there are remedial activities that are provided as well.

Responsibilities and structures related to the organization of exams are clearly defined. The timing of exams is organized appropriately, and examination dates are announced in a timely manner. Suitable opportunities to re-sit an exam are offered as necessary.

The long-term data regarding the number of failed course examinations in the programmes used for evaluation and to improve the programmes should be continuously collected for planning and evaluation of course learning outcomes. Currently, the data is limited and the faculty and university can come up with ways of collecting and analyzing such data for continuous improvement.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

The methods of teaching and learning are appropriate and correspond with the intended learning outcomes of the Doctor of Management programme. The programme prides itself as being interactive within lectures, discussions and contextual learning. As a Doctoral programme, it provides enough preparation through intensive coursework and provision of research methodologies to conduct doctoral level research.

The methods of teaching and learning respect and take the diversity of students and their needs into account, enabling flexible learning paths especially for working students by providing classes scheduled on Fridays and Saturdays. An integrated online learning system also allows students to access class materials and submit course activities. The programme also makes sure that 50% of the learning time is used for discussions and presentations where students work and learn independently and are given the opportunity to present their findings in class.

The supervision that fosters the academic progress of the research work is commendable because of the close relationship between supervisor and student, and among students, as well. The students chose this university for its research expertise and the presence of capable supervisors, as the experts learned during the site visit.

The assessment regulations are made readily available in published form to students. The information is also provided online.

The examination procedures are transparent, and students know their class standing. The responsibilities and structures related to the organization of examinations are clearly defined and students have ready access to information that is related to their dissertation.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled. Methods of teaching, learning and assessment support an interlacing of theoretical and practical aspects which are evident e.g. in the field experience programmes and community service programmes. Field experience programmes include designation of work practice, internship and industrial practice, while community service programmes are carried out with a partner site through the university. The programmes thus enable students to transfer their knowledge to situations outside the university context.

4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification / Legal Status, Admission and Certification

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<i>Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.</i> <i>[ESG 1.4]</i>	<i>The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.</i> <i>Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.</i> <i>[ESG 1.4]</i>

Description

“Management” (Bachelor & Master degree) & “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

Student Admission

According to national regulations, admission is based on different procedures: national selection, joint selection of state universities and independent selection of UPI. Each procedure is allocated with a maximum number of students to be admitted. National selection is based on an Institute of Higher Education Entrance Test and computer-based writing tests, according to the information provided in the SER. UPI’s independent selection procedures are determined by the Academic Directorate.

Requirements for the Master programme are a Bachelor’s degree with a GPA of at least 2.75 as well as the successful completion of UPI’s entrance selection. Additionally, students have to hand in a research plan and provide proof of proficient English language skills. The programme is designed as a multi-entry programme open as well to students without an educational background in Economics or Management who have to take additional courses (see Chapter IV.1).

Progression

Student’s progression is monitored via the academic supervisors and the student directory system which is accessible to the head of the programme, as outlined by UPI.

Recognition and Certification

UPI outlines procedures for student transfer and the recognition of informal education. At the end of studies, UPI issues a diploma and a transcript.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

Degree-awarding powers

UPI is a state university by presidential decree and according to government regulations.

Admission and certification

As laid out in the relevant directorate decree, admission requirements for the Doctoral programme are a Master degree from an accredited domestic or overseas university which is accredited by the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education with a minimum GPA of 3.00 as well as passing the entrance test. Furthermore, students must provide proof of sufficient English language skills and of the ability to publish scientific work by attendances of international seminars and published articles in reputable Scopus-indexed journals. The selection of applicants is carried out by the UPI management and lecturers of the programme.

The same regulations concerning the recognition of competences as described above apply to the Doctoral programme.

Upon completion of their studies, graduates receive a diploma signed by the Chancellor, a value transcript and a Certificate of Companion Diploma with further information on the programme, as laid out in the SER.

Experts’ Evaluation

“Management” (Bachelor & Master degree) & “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

In terms of student admission, the formal requirements are clearly defined and available in published form in Indonesian on the website of UPI; an English translation would be a further improvement. Language requirements for English are set in form of a minimum score in TOEFL of 550, which is preferably to be achieved before the student begins his/her studies but which is latest to be achieved as an eligibility criterion for the Bachelor thesis. Also, the selection procedures for both

the Bachelor and Master programmes are openly communicated by UPI on its website, which says that national selection, joint selection of state universities and independent selection by UPI is conducted in order to choose students according to the respective maximum capacities.

The admission criteria for the Bachelor programmes – to which the passing of the Higher Education Entrance Test and a computer-based writing test also belong – support the objectives of the study programmes. In order to enrol for the Master programme, the student requires a successfully finished Bachelor study and needs to pass the UPI selection procedure. All in all, the measures taken in student admission are appropriate.

A specialty of the Master programme that needs to be commented on is the multi-entry system, a common practice in the Indonesian higher education system which allows students with a non-linear academic background to study at UPI after they have finished the so-called *aanvullen* courses. According to the documentation and information of the teaching staff, the multi-entry system does not reduce the quality of the students as non-linear students are closely supervised and supported by the teaching staff. Nevertheless, it is recommended that the student progression of non-linear students is documented more closely and also separately in order to detect potential student issues (**Finding 12**, see Chapter IV.1).

The efforts of UPI with regard to the student progression are deemed to be sufficient because the students are well supervised by the teaching staff and, thus, the progress of each and every student is tightly monitored. This is also evident by a high average grade of 3.49 in the Bachelor programme “Management” and the fact that the vast majority of students finishes their studies within the intended time being 8 semesters in “Management” (Bachelor degree) and “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree), and 4 semesters in “Management” (Master degree). Such short study times can be achieved by the possibility that students in their Bachelor studies may accelerate their studies by studying a limited amount of courses in the semester breaks. This opportunity increases the flexibility of students and supports student progression positively. The fact that only students who exceed a certain threshold in their GPA may accelerate their studies is deemed to be an important and good implementation for the Bachelor programmes.

In terms of student recognition, UPI offers mechanisms of transfer to students and provides three clear criteria from which one needs to be met in order to have their prior academic performance/learning recognised. The three criteria are (1) a transfer from the same academic field, (2) transfer from non-related academic field and (3) transfer from an exchange programme. Due to the fact that in criterion (1) the student's prior learning that is subject to transfer is evaluated and that in criterion (2) students need to attend all offered courses in order to get to the same level of learning, the recognition is reasonable and within the regulatory framework.

Ultimately, students who successfully finish their Bachelor or Master studies receive a diploma supplement containing information on the qualification gained, the context, level and status of studies signed by the Chancellor and a transcript. According to the demanded certification requirements, UPI acts adequately and satisfactorily.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

UPI is a state university with presidential decree and is thus legally entitled to award doctorates. UPI presents an academic framework for the Doctoral degree in Management, and also national regulations are existent to govern the award of the Doctoral degree.

In terms of admission and certification, the Doctoral degree of UPI meets all relevant prescribed criteria. More precisely, for admission to the Doctoral degree a Master degree is required. Upon completion of their studies, graduates receive a diploma signed by the Chancellor, a value transcript and a Certificate of Companion Diploma with further information on the programme. An example of

the Diploma Supplement was handed to the panel during the site visit. This example fulfilled the requirements with regard to certification.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled. Particularly strong points are the multi-entry system, the close supervision of students and student progression by professors, which is qualitatively and quantitatively impressive. It is recommended to closely document the progression of non-linear students in the Master programme in order to support them in case of problems.

5. Teaching Staff / Academic Level of Supervisory Staff

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.</i></p> <p><i>Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.5]</i></p>	<p><i>The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</i></p> <p><i>Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.</i></p> <p><i>Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.</i></p> <p><i>[ESG 1.5]</i></p>

Description

According to UPI, lecturers may participate in professional trainings offered by the university or the Indonesian authorities. The educational workforce development programme is offered by the Human Resources Division of UPI. The university claims to provide incentives for lecturers to attend seminars and workshops related to the development of science and scientific networks at national and international level. Programmes offered are also open to administrative personnel, according to the information provided by UPI, and cover topics such as technical capacity building activities (IT, finance, administration, filing, procurement of goods and services, English, and ISO), benchmarking activities for administrative management and quality assurance.

Recruitment procedures follow the policies of UPI and national regulations, according to the information in the SER. The recruitment process is carried out openly through announcements on the UPI website. The selection process is carried out in several stages; the admission decision is explained to be based on the evaluation by the university and the authorities.

“Management” (Bachelor & Master degree) & “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

In the SER, UPI states that 14 permanent lecturers within the fields of human resource management, marketing management, financial management and operations management teach in the Bachelor programme of “Management”. Additionally, 2 lecturers have functional positions as professors.

The number of teaching staff in the Master programme adds up to 7 full-time professors and 10 full-time lecturers, according to UPI.

Lecturers in the Bachelor programme “Office Management Education” amount to 17, as stated in the SER. Of those 17, 2 are professors, 11 are head lecturers and 4 are lecturers.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

8 full-time professors and 4 full-time lecturers are listed by UPI as lecturers in the Doctoral programme. 3 external lecturers provide further teaching in the programme.

Experts’ Evaluation

“Management” (Bachelor & Master degree) & “Office Management Education” (Bachelor degree)

The number of teaching staff is sufficient for the deliverance of the programmes. The experts met very motivated and engaged staff. Within the programmes the number of female lecturers is commendable.

As the rector of UPI has explained to the experts, it is not easy for the university to find qualified teaching staff to increase the number of lecturers and professors. The minimum requirement for staff is a Master degree. 107 staff members were recently recruited, but only 5 of them had a Doctoral degree. One of the incentives for staff is to continue research and publish articles in high-ranked journals to pursue their research. That is why one of UPI’s aims is to introduce a scholarship programme for its doctoral students. UPI also provides a budget for lecturers to carry out research and publish their work. Master lecturers must publish their work on their way to acquiring their Doctoral degree. Training on qualitative research will, for example, be taken at Magdeburg University in the future.

Also, UPI informed about the policy by the ministry concerning the qualification of teaching staff. For the Bachelor programmes the minimum is a Master’s degree and for the postgraduate studies the minimum is a Doctoral degree; to be a supervisor one must be a professor. All in all, there are 128 professors and 342 assistant professors at UPI. The teacher-student ration is 1:13 in the School of Postgraduate Studies and e.g. 1:20 in the Bachelor programme “Management”, which are good ratios for Asian standards.

However, the number of full/associate professors in the Master programme is considered as not sufficient by UPI itself due to the above-mentioned difficulties in finding staff with Doctoral degrees. Furthermore, the opportunity to become a civil servant in Indonesia is limited at the moment, as outlined during the site visit. UPI tries to remedy the problem by temporary employment rather than hiring teaching staff as civil servants. Thus, most of the teaching staff receives a permanent position at the university.

The CVs of the teaching staff are well documented within academic and other relevant qualifications. It can be confirmed that the teaching staff is qualified for the subject fields in the programmes. The workload is well documented and manageable. There are no vacancies in the next years. The retirement age in Indonesia is 65 years, but many teach until the age of 70. Right now, most of the staff is far from the retirement age; the average length of employment is remarkable. Many staff members have been employed for over 15 years by UPI. However, it would be beneficial to create a concept for complementing the long-term staff with new and younger staff members.

Recruitment procedures were described to the experts in detail. The requirements are a combination of government- and UPI-standards: Academic qualification, working experience as a lecturer as well as scientific publications and research. The recruitment is open and advertised on the website. Also, alumni have the chance to apply and this is a recruitment strategy that is well used by UPI.

The applicants have to prove their English language skills by a defined minimum TOEFL-score (or similar); however, most courses in the programmes are not taught in English (see Chapter IV.1). It

would be beneficial to support the staff more intensely in improving their English skills to foster the goal of becoming an international university and to increase the number of courses taught in English. Also, UPI should bear in mind to provide training in digital competences regularly for new and permanent staff.

It appears that most lecturers have been trained academically at UPI or in the region. UPI should increase its efforts to employ teaching staff which has been qualified outside Bandung and Indonesia to widen the network and foster joint research (**Finding 15**). It would also increase the diversity among the teaching staff.

External lecturers – mostly from banking, telecommunication and manufacturing sectors – are well involved in the programmes. Teaching staff is also invited from foreign universities and the entire staff has the chance to attend programmes to develop their skills. These involve science and didactic aspects. The staff can, for example, also attend to a training with USAid on Entrepreneurship or a training for dissertation supervision. Obligatory courses before becoming teaching staff and structuralized training exist. The different programmes have individual additional trainings, e.g. “Office Management Education” offers a training to become an assessor for competency tests. Every faculty has its own strategic plan for personnel development. The impact of the trainings is measured, e.g. if the productivity of the staff increases as well as research and teaching. At the end, it is one of the essential aims of UPI to support lecturers in becoming professors.

“Management” (Doctoral degree)

At first, it can be highlighted that all human resources involved in teaching within the programme are documented, including their academic qualifications and research. The teaching staff of the Master programme is the same as in the Doctoral programme.

All teaching staff in the Doctoral programme must have a Doctoral degree. The overall workload of the staff is 12 credit hours for teaching, 2 credit hours for research and 2 credit hours for community service. It is recommended to increase the credit hours for research in order to support teaching staff in their research with the aim of facilitating joint research and publications with students (**Finding 16**).

Furthermore, UPI has explained that the number of teachers in the Doctoral programme is satisfying and the experts agree with this assessment. External supervisors are involved, e.g. for methodical trainings. Also, the teaching staff is receiving trainings to increase their competencies in research. The areas of responsibility of all supervisors are clear and transparent.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled. The programmes are taught by qualified and very motivated teaching staff who receive ample support in their further development. The experts understood that the context of finding qualified professors and Doctoral degree holders is challenging in Indonesia at the moment and they encourage UPI to continue its efforts in increasing the number of teaching staff. One option, which would also have positive effects on expanding research networks, is to explicitly hire staff who has been educated outside UPI, West Java or the country. For the development of teaching staff, UPI could provide further support in improving English skills and in expanding the credit hours allocated to research.

6. Learning Resources and Student Support / Support and Research Environment

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<p><i>Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.</i></p> <p><i>Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.6]</p>	<p><i>Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.</i></p> <p><i>Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.</i></p> <p>[ESG 1.6]</p>

Description

UPI is state-funded and charges tuition fees for its programmes. As outlined in the SER, there are several scholarship opportunities for students. UPI funds are allocated to the faculties and programmes in accordance with the budget ceiling. Programmes are supposed to be independent in using their budget by drafting an annual activity plan and budget.

The programmes are offered on UPI's campus in Bandung, which includes classrooms, libraries, laboratory rooms, computer labs as well as sports facilities. In particular, UPI lists 39 lecture halls.

According to UPI, it uses a management information system which is accessible to students and which contains information on courses and examinations.

"Management" (Bachelor & Master degree) & "Office Management Education" (Bachelor degree)

UPI outlines various activities to implement the goals of student support defined by its Strategic Plan 2016–2020. According to the SER, at the beginning of studies, UPI offers a campus orientation period to new students. During their studies, students are assigned an academic supervisor/advisor who provides consulting services related to academic and non-academic activities. Furthermore, support is clustered at the Integrated Service Unit of Guidance and Career Development and Counseling. The services offered include guidance and counseling (with regard to academic services, social fields and individual fields), individual planning and psychological assessment (such as intelligence tests, talents, interests) as well as career development (e.g. cv making training, interview training employment, scholarship information, full time/part time job vacancies information).

UPI claims to offer special services for students with special needs or special conditions, especially for students with low economic levels. For incoming students, the programmes coordinate offerings with the university's Office of International Education and Relations. Daycare facilities can be used by students who have children.

"Management" (Doctoral degree)

Students in the Doctoral programme are also supported by an academic supervisor and the Integrated Service Unit of Guidance and Career Development and Counseling, as outlined above. The same applies to students with special needs and incoming students.

Furthermore, a coaching programme provides help in publishing scientific papers internationally.

Experts' Evaluation

"Management" (Bachelor & Master degree) & "Office Management Education" (Bachelor degree)

The course modules and course descriptions for the Bachelor and Master programmes are available for the students in Indonesian language. The documents, methods of learning and teaching, assessment methods, intended learning outcomes and the expected workload are communicated

via the course descriptions. However, it is recommended that the long list of intended learning outcomes per module is to be shortened in order to set a clear focus on what the core intended learning outcomes are (**Finding 5**, see Chapter IV.1). Communicating a large number of intended learning outcomes to the students leads to uncertainty in terms of the key learning objectives of a course.

The Bachelor and Master programmes are implemented in a way that the intended study duration can be realistically achieved, which also becomes evident by the fact that the vast majority of students finishes their studies in time or even before due to the possibility to accelerate studies by taking courses in the semester break (see also Chapter IV.1).

In terms of student support, the teaching staff of the Bachelor and Master programmes acts commendable: first, the ratio of one teacher to 29 students is good; second, the programmes appoint academic supervisors to students, and professors also provide consultancy services under the Unit of Guidance and Career Development Counseling. Furthermore, students with special needs or special conditions receive appropriate support to finish their studies on time and in a good manner. All different support offers are communicated publicly through UPI's website. For the Bachelor and Master these two professors are assigned to each student to provide help and consultancy for the research and writing process, which is satisfactory.

When it comes to the learning resources, UPI provides all necessary facilities to students, e. g. a well-equipped library, computer rooms, laboratories for different purposes as well as an appropriate amount of lecture halls. The programmes would benefit, however, from the use of a wider range of software programmes, such as open source programmes.

In terms of financial resources, the programmes are in a safe position as UPI is a state funded university and also collects tuition fees from the students to sufficiently finance the respective programmes. Even though the library itself made a good impression to the experts, the experts recommend to give students wider access to current and up-to-date literature, especially literature in English (**Finding 8**, see Chapter IV.1). This also includes access to a larger number of international journals. The recent publications should be used in courses and especially for the research that students do in the programmes. To improve the situation, UPI could explore partnerships with other Indonesian universities in order to establish cooperation networks to provide a greater choice of current literature.

Connected to this topic is the field of academic writing. The recommendation of the panel of experts is that academic writing is trained more thoroughly in the Bachelor curriculum of "Management", e. g. in form of a mandatory course (**Finding 4**, see Chapter IV.1). So far, it seems especially students suffer from the lack of academic writing expertise when they approach their Bachelor thesis.

"Management" (Doctoral degree)

The support for the students of this Management programme is existent from the very beginning of studies. The students may choose one qualified professor who has his/her area of expertise in the field that the students want to write his/her dissertation in. This professor is then supervising the student in the process of research, the actual writing process, the selection of courses and the professor is also closely monitoring the student's progress. The average study duration of 3.7 years is actually shorter than the intended study duration of eight semesters, which shows that the degree of support given to the students is appropriate. According to the information given by the respective teaching staff, feedback sessions take place regularly throughout the research process which is in line with this criterion.

Also, in terms of facilities the doctoral students are well supported, they even have extra study rooms only reserved for them to conduct their research process with highest concentration. Additionally, scholarships for the doctoral students are provided through the e.g. Domestic Postgraduate Education Scholarship programme or New State Affirmation Scholarship programme. According to

the SER, to secure the availability of adequate learning materials for the doctoral students the materials are stored in the respective facilities in the university. All these learning resources support the achievement of the intended learning outcomes and are considered satisfactory. Nevertheless, the recommendation to widen the range of and access to literature and archives also holds for this Doctoral Management programme (see above).

The research environment of the doctoral students is also convincing as it facilitates the relevant research and fosters qualifications necessary for a career inside and outside academia. Furthermore, opportunities for national and international academic exchange are made available through the participation in international conferences or workshops. The programme also includes practical phases in which the students are supported by the professors, who make use of a comprehensive alumni network of UPI. In these practical phases, the students are also involved in the organisation and administration of research projects. UPI with its consultation services also offers assistance for the doctoral students to explore career paths outside academia. However, it is a goal of this programme to train academics and not necessarily practitioners.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled. A strong point in the context of criterion ESG 1.6 is the student support by professors among all three study cycles (Bachelor, Master, Doctoral degree). Nonetheless, the panel of experts recommends the implementation of a mandatory academic writing course to support the research and writing process especially in the Bachelor programme “Management”, and the extension of access to academic literature and other sources of information such as databases.

7. Information / Public Information

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
<i>Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.</i>	<i>Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.</i>
[ESG 1.8]	[ESG 1.8]

Description

Information on the programmes, i.e. the learning objectives, the curriculum, the admission criteria and procedures, is available on the UPI website, according to the university. Learning material and the course handbooks are said to be updated regularly, usually every year.

Experts' Evaluation

All procedures and regulations are made transparent and are accessible for applicants, students, graduates and all other stakeholders. The relevant information is communicated within UPI concerning Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes' procedures and externally via websites and printed media.

The framework for UPI's programmes is determined in parts by the government. UPI is audited by the government, which also checks the achievement of the defined targets.

UPI keeps close contact to students, stakeholders and alumni. It provides all required information to partners in (service) industries and public institutions. Information to the public and for the students is updated regularly. Learning material and the course content are usually revised annually.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled by a range of information material available on UPI's website and in printed form.

IV. Recommendations of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit

the study programmes in “**Management**” (Bachelor of Economics, Master of Management and Doctor of Management) offered by **Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia**.

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit with conditions

the study programme in “**Office Management Education**” (Bachelor of Education) offered by **Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia**.

Findings:

1. Current issues, such as Industry 4.0 and digitalization, should be included in the curricula of the Bachelor and Master programmes more prominently, and current trends in the field should be integrated into the curricula as quickly as possible.
2. The university should further develop its aim of internationalization. In order to strengthen internationalization at home, the university could increase the number of English courses and invite guest lecturers from foreign universities.
3. Efforts to conduct joint research with staff from other universities in Indonesia and beyond should be fostered.
4. Academic writing should be trained more intensely in the Bachelor programme “Management”, e.g. by offering a mandatory course within the curriculum.
5. The intended learning outcomes of courses in the programmes should be focused and reduced to a number of essential outcomes, of which the achievement can be monitored.
6. The assessment forms in the programmes should be aligned with the essential learning outcomes, including less examinations and a larger variety of assessment types.
7. Assessment criteria in the Bachelor programme “Management” including the composition of the grade could be outlined more transparently for students prior to the beginning of the lecture period, e.g. in the course catalogue.
8. Students of all programmes should receive greater access to current and up-to-date literature, especially literature in English. This also includes access to a larger number of international journals.
9. The university has to demonstrate how the Bachelor programme “Office Management Education” corresponds to level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework and transparently describe the relevant skills to be acquired to become a teacher.
10. The Bachelor programme “Office Management Education” should focus exclusively on teacher education and all courses should contribute to the acquisition of relevant skills to become a teacher.
11. The Master programme “Management” could highlight the relevance of its specializations in order to sharpen the profile of the programme but also to indicate the individual profiles of graduates.

12. The faculty should closely monitor the performance on linear and non-linear students in the Master programme "Management" in case performances differ and non-linear students would need further assistance.
13. Currently, UPI offers two structures in the doctoral programme "Management", a "doctor by course" and a "doctor by research". The experts recommend to revise the programme into one structured programme with limited initial course work and subsequent research and publications.
14. The experts recommend to use the data from QA as a strategic tool more intensely.
15. UPI should increase its efforts to employ teaching staff which has been qualified outside Bandung and Indonesia.
16. It is recommended to increase the credit hours of teaching staff for research in the Doctor of Management programme.